

11/21  
105W  
1  
ORIGINAL

1

2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
CONFIDENTIAL

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT  
TWENTIETH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT  
ST. CLAIR COUNTY, ILLINOIS  
NO. 91-L-734

CHARLES KUEPER and PATRICIA )  
KUEPER, Individually, and )  
PATRICIA KUEPER, as Mother )  
and Next Friend of JEFFREY )  
KUEPER, )

Plaintiffs, ) DISCOVERY DEPOSITION OF:

vs. ) ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D.

R.J.R., INC., R. J. REYNOLDS )  
TOBACCO CO., and REESE DRUGS, )  
INC., )

Defendants. )

The discovery deposition of ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D.  
was taken in Meeting Room 542 of the Marriott Hotel,  
#1 Marriott Drive, Piedmont Triad International Airport,  
Greensboro, North Carolina, commencing at 2:20 p.m. on  
Thursday, November 21, 1991.

50833 4255

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

## APPEARANCES

2 On behalf of the Plaintiffs:  
3 BRUCE N. COOK, ESQUIRE  
4 Cook, Shevlin & Keefe, Ltd.  
12 West Lincoln Street  
Belleville, Illinois 62220

5 On behalf of R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Company:  
6 ROBERT F. McDERMOTT, JR., ESQUIRE  
7 Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue  
Metropolitan Square  
1450 G Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005-2088

9 PAUL G. CRIST, ESQUIRE  
10 STEPHEN J. KACZYNSKI, ESQUIRE  
11 Jones, Day, Reavis & Pogue  
North Point  
901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114

12 RICHARD E. BOYLE, ESQUIRE  
13 Gundlach, Lee, Eggmann, Boyle & Roessler  
14 5000 West Main Street  
Box 899  
Belleville, Illinois 62223

15 CHARLES A. BLIXT, ESQUIRE  
16 Assistant General Counsel  
17 R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Company  
Winston-Salem, North Carolina 27102

18 On behalf of Reese Drug Stores, Inc.:  
MICHAEL J. NESTER, ESQUIRE  
19 Donovan, Rose, Nester & Szewczyk, P.C.  
20 8 East Washington Street  
Belleville, Illinois 62220

21 Also Present:  
22 DANIEL W. DONAHUE, ESQUIRE  
23 Vice President & Deputy General Counsel - Litigation  
R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Company  
23 Winston-Salem, North Carolina 27102

**SANDRA HARPER, NOTARY PUBLIC AND COURT REPORTER**

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

	<u>INDEX</u>	
1		
2	<u>WITNESS</u>	<u>EXAMINATION BY</u>
3	Robert A. Lloyd, Jr., Ph.D.	Mr. Cook
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

*Sandra Harper & Associates*

50833 4257  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694



1 WHEREUPON,

2 ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D.

3 first being duly sworn, testified as follows:

4 EXAMINATION BY MR. COOK

5 Q (By Mr. Cook) Would you state your name and  
6 address, sir?

7 A Robert A. Lloyd, Jr., [DELETED]

8  
9 Q Dr. Lloyd, I understand you're a Ph.D., sir?

10 A That's correct.

11 Q And from what university did you obtain your  
12 doctorate in philosophy?

13 A Clemson University.

14 Q What year did you receive that?

15 A About 1968.

16 Q What was the title of your dissertation? Is it all  
17 sold out?

18 A I couldn't quote you.

19 Q What was it about?

20 A It was about nuclear magnetic resonance  
21 investigations of a particular keteneimine.

22 Q Sounds interesting to me--is that mechanical  
23 engineering?

24 A No, it's chemistry, organic chemistry.

25 Q Do you have a master's degree?

50833 4259

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1       A    Yes, I do.

2       Q    From where?

3       A    Clemson University.

4       Q    And your bachelor's, Clemson also?

5       A    No, High Point College.

6       Q    And after you received your Ph.D.--are you  
7 forty-nine years old?

8       A    Fifty.

9       Q    I'm not usually off that much. When did you turn  
10 fifty?

11      A    In May--actually, I'm fifty-one. I don't like to  
12 admit that.

13      Q    Well, I was fifty-one in February. You and I are of  
14 an age. You're better looking than I am, and I'm richer than  
15 you are; you can't have everything. After you got your Ph.D.  
16 from Clemson--I may not be richer than you because a lot of  
17 you Ph.D.s have got patents--what did you do next  
18 professionally?

19      A    Went to work for R. J. Reynolds Tobacco Company.

20      Q    What did you do with them?

21      A    I started out working with industrial starch  
22 chemistry. We owned a company at the time called Penick &  
23 Ford which is in the starch business, and I worked in that  
24 part of the business.

25      Q    Is that starched food or starched collars?

50833 4260

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 A It was starch polymers actually. *Ray*

2 Q How long did you--was that a separate corporation or  
3 division?

4 A It was a separate part of the company but the work  
5 was done by the tobacco research group.

6 Q How long did you work on starch?

7 A I think about two years.

8 Q What did you do next?

9 A Worked in the tobacco isolation area in the area of  
10 high resolution gas chromatography, high resolution  
11 separations, isolation of tobacco components.

12 Q Why were you trying to isolate the tobacco  
13 components?

14 A Well, we were interested in finding those components  
15 which contributed to good tobacco flavor. There was an idea  
16 that if we could isolate the things from good tobacco that  
17 made it taste good, then we might be able to improve poor  
18 quality tobacco, poor quality tasting tobacco.

19 Q Were you successful?

20 A No, I'm afraid we weren't.

21 Q Do you know what makes tobacco taste good?

22 A Tobacco and tobacco smoke ~~would be an~~ <sup>are</sup> *Ray* extremely  
23 complex mixture <sup>s</sup> *Ray* of chemical components, extremely complex.  
24 It's been estimated--well, we've isolated and identified as  
25 many as 4,000 components and it's estimated that there could

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4261

1 be many more than that that we have not isolated and  
2 identified.

3 Q How do you decide which of the components are  
4 pleasing to the taste?

5 A Well, therein is a part of the problem. You  
6 identify them from very, very small amounts, nanogram  
7 quantities sometimes, and then you have to procure the  
8 particular product once you've isolated it in large enough  
9 quantity to test and that's sticky sometimes.

10 Q How do you test flavor--taste?

11 A Yes.

12 Q To see if people like it?

13 A Right.

14 Q Do you taste the actual component or do you try and  
15 isolate that component in smoke?

16 A Well, once you've identified the component, once you  
17 have that component in hand from a synthetic source or  
18 isolated from tobacco, then you could apply it to a cigarette  
19 and smoke it.

20 Q Do different people have different tastes as far as  
21 what's good and what's bad or what's good and what's very good  
22 in cigarette smoke?

23 A Well, we have a number of people within house,  
24 within the R&D Department, who are--we might call them "Top  
25 Tongues," but they're supposed to be very expert in tobacco

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4262

1 taste and in tobaccos which give good taste. I'm not sure  
2 whether that totally carries over to the consumer, however.

3 Q Like noses in brandy sniffing?

4 A Yes, very similar to that.

5 Q How many of those type people do you have?

6 A I don't think there are very many anymore; at one  
7 time there were a good number--maybe ten. We rely much less  
8 on that these days, and we do more work with actual consumers  
9 in final product and acceptance.

10 Q What did you do after you completed your isolation  
11 period?

12 A I went to work in a more applied tobacco area where  
13 we were looking at cigarette papers, cigarette tobaccos and  
14 levels of menthol, levels of moisture on the tobacco and how  
15 they might affect acceptance. I worked on shelf life of  
16 cigarettes as well.

17 Q Do you smoke yourself?

18 A Yes, I do.

19 Q What type of cigarette do you smoke?

20 A Well, I smoke the Ultra Light, and I also smoke  
21 ~~Premiere~~ *OKT*

22 Q Do you ever take your product yourself and measure  
23 it against your competition?

24 A I'm not sure I understand what you mean--measure it  
25 how?

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4263

1       Q     Would you smoke a Marlboro and then smoke a Winston  
2 or a Camel and then say, you know, "This Marlboro," or "This  
3 tastes better because it's got more of something in it, and  
4 we're going to put more of that in ours"; do you do that type  
5 of thing?

6       A     We do some comparisons but it's not quite as easy to  
7 say why they taste differently. As I said there are thousands  
8 of compounds in that smoke.

9       Q     Do they taste differently, Marlboros and Winstons?

10      A     I think they do but that's my own personal taste.

11      Q     It seems to me that a chemist with your background  
12 and with the equipment that you've got that you ought to be  
13 able to determine what the make-up is of a Marlboro cigarette  
14 in terms of the tobaccos; can you do that?

15      A     We can measure components down to a very fine level  
16 using something like high resolution gas chromatography, mass  
17 ~~spectroscopy~~ <sup>RAY</sup> ~~spectrography~~ and there are thousands in there as far as--

18      Q     I can say encephalography; do you know what that is?

19      A     No.

20      Q     I do.

21      A     But once we've measured them, that doesn't tell us  
22 anything about how they're going to taste or what their  
23 contribution to taste is.

24      Q     Have you ever tried to do that, to produce a  
25 Marlboro?

50833 4264

Sandra Hayter & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1       A    Yes, we have.

2       Q    Did you get close?

3       A    I don't know.

4       Q    Well, did you get close enough that you couldn't  
5 tell the distinction between their cigarette and yours?

6       A    Well, I didn't do it personally.

7       Q    Are you aware of people in your R&D group who have  
8 done that; I mean, did they say they could do it or not do it?

9       A    Well, Marlboro is the largest selling brand in the  
10 United States. We've certainly looked at it in great depth  
11 trying to determine why that is, and we've put a lot of effort  
12 into that. I can't say that we've ever completely duplicated  
13 it.

14      Q    I'm of the impression that Marlboros' lead was  
15 because of their advertisements in the early 1970s; I just  
16 thought they were better. You think that they have a taste  
17 advantage?

18      A    They taste different. I don't know that I could  
19 tell you that it's a taste advantage.

20      Q    Well, apparently at some period of time in the 1970s  
21 when you were here, Winston went from the number one filter  
22 cigarette to Marlboro going to the number one filter cigarette  
23 in apparently a rather dramatic fashion--boom! They did have  
24 that very successful advertising campaign; I'm sure that you  
25 remember the Marlboro Man and--

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4265

1           A     I'm afraid I do remember it very dramatically, yes.

2           Q     I do too. Do you remember what color his car was  
3 when he left, the Marlboro Man, when he left with the tuxedo  
4 on, came off the ranch; is that the Marlboro Man with the hat  
5 on or is that the Winston guy?

6           A     I don't know.

7           MR. McDERMOTT: I always thought he rode a horse.

8           MR. COOK: He rode a horse in, shaved, put his  
9 tuxedo on, took his cowboy hat off and got in a red  
10 Corvette and drove off. You guys aren't as old as I am.

11          Q     (By Mr. Cook) Have you tried to make Winstons taste  
12 like Marlboros?

13          A     Well, again that's a complicated question. We've  
14 got a franchise out there that likes the taste of Winston. We  
15 don't want to lose that franchise to gain Marlboro smokers.

16          Q     Have you tried to duplicate it in another brand; I  
17 guess "duplicate" is an unfair term. Have you tried to  
18 approach the Marlboro flavor in some other cigarette?

19          A     We have had other cigarettes out there which were  
20 more like the Marlboro taste signature than Winston is.

21          Q     What would those have been?

22          A     I think Dakota which was in test market was probably  
23 closer to the Marlboro signature than our Winston brand.

24          Q     How about some of your Camel brands?

25          A     They might be.

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4266

1 Q How many different Camel brands are there, Doctor?

2 A I'm not quite sure.

3 Q What did you do next; how long did that go on?

4 A I worked in that area about four years and went from  
5 there to working in New Brands.

6 Q What would you do in New Brands?

7 A Well, we looked at a lot of different ideas for  
8 prototypes that might become new brands. One example is I  
9 worked on an adjustable filter cigarette, sort of a dial-in-  
10 the-tar-that-you-want product. It started out at about a full  
11 flavor product, and you could dial it down to ultra low tar.  
12 Philip Morris actually test marketed a product like that and  
13 it failed.

14 Q When you were working on testing that, the cigarette  
15 paper, or working with cigarette paper, do you have glue on  
16 your cigarette papers?

17 A Yes, we have glue on our cigarette papers.

18 Q Is that how they're--you don't roll your own  
19 anymore? Is it a trade secret what your glues are or are they  
20 the same on all of them?

21 MR. BLIXT: No, they are not the same on all of  
22 them and yes, it is a trade secret.

23 Q (By Mr. Cook) Have you ever done any testing to  
24 determine whether or not the glue on your cigarette paper is  
25 carcinogenic?

Sandra Harper & Associates

50833 4267  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1       A     I've never worked with the glues on the cigarette  
2 paper.

3       Q     Do you know of anybody who has done such testing?

4       A     I don't know about that particular testing, no.

5       Q     Are there any carcinogens contained to your  
6 knowledge in the glue used on your cigarettes?

7       A     I don't know what's in those glues.

8       Q     Did you work on Premier? *QAY*

9       A     Yes, I did.

10      Q     What are you doing now?

11      A     I'm working in New Brands again.

12      Q     What do you do in New Brands?

13      A     Well, we're developing some products which again  
14 will lower tar, and we're working with some other things.

15      Q     Like what?

16      A     Well, we're working--

17      MR. BLIXT: I think the specifics of what Dr. Lloyd  
18 is working on are brands that are not yet introduced to  
19 the market and may at some point in the future be  
20 introduced to the market. I mean, in general terms I  
21 think you can ask some of these questions, but we're not  
22 going to let him answer what specific products he's  
23 working on that may be future products that we would  
24 introduce into the marketplace.

25      Q     (By Mr. Cook) Are you working on anything that

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1      might affect or have any relationship to health hazards or the  
2      appearance of health hazards connected with cigarettes?

3      A      Well, as I said I'm working to lower tar.

4      Q      Anything else? I don't know; is there a  
5      relationship between--for example, when you worked on Premier  
6      which I understand was a smokeless cigarette--a fireless  
7      cigarette, not a smokeless cigarette--what was it?

8      A      It was described that way by the media, as a  
9      smokeless cigarette.

10     Q      Did it smoke?

11     A      It produced a mainstream smoke which smokers could  
12     inhale; it didn't have any smoke from the lit end.

13     Q      Did you like those?

14     A      Yes, I did.

15     Q      Are you still working on that project; I mean, is  
16     that gone forever or is it on the back burner or is there  
17     still research going on in something of this nature without  
18     being specific about it?

19     A      There is still research going on.

20     Q      Do you know why Premier ~~failed~~ <sup>QAY</sup>? Was it test  
21     marketed?

22     A      Yes, it was test marketed. It failed because it  
23     didn't have a taste that was acceptable to consumers.

24     Q      Was it tarless?

25     A      That's a complicated question.

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4269

1       Q     Can you give me either a complicated or  
2 understandable answer as you see fit?

3       A     It had no tar from burning tobacco. Tar is  
4 evaluated by measuring the amount of substance that is  
5 deposited on a pad during a specific smoking regimen. There's  
6 a weight of material there but the composition of that  
7 material was very different than the composition of tar from  
8 burning tobacco. That's perhaps an oversimplification.

9       Q     It was sufficiently difficult for me. Do people if  
10 they smoke, for want of a better word, a ~~Premiere~~, do they  
11 ingest nicotine?

12      A     Yes.

13      Q     What is nicotine?

14      A     What is nicotine?

15      Q     Yes.

16      A     Well, it's an organic base.

17      Q     Is it contained in other things other than tobacco?

18      A     There are small amounts in similar species like  
19 tomatoes, relatively small amounts, however.

20      MR. COOK: I've never smoked a tomato.

21      MR. BLIXT: You'll have to try it, Bruce.

22      MR. COOK: I will; I've done some things with  
23 tomato juice that were good before.

24      Q     (By Mr. Cook) Dr. Lloyd, do you supervise other  
25 scientists now or are you engaged in pure research yourself?

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 A I supervise others.

2 Q How many do you supervise?

3 A About twenty.

4 Q Do you engage in experimentation yourself or do you  
5 set up protocols and manage their experimentation?

6 A I don't do any myself.

7 Q How long has it been since you've done any?

8 A A long time, over ten years.

9 Q What type of equipment do you have available to use  
10 in your experimentation?

11 A I think we have excellent state-of-the-art  
12 equipment.

13 Q How many Ph.D.s--well, I'm not going to ask that;  
14 does R. J. Reynolds have more Ph.D.s than Clemson does in  
15 chemistry?

16 A I don't know.

17 Q What do you think?

18 A I don't know how many they have now.

19 Q Clemson or R. J. Reynolds?

20 A Actually, I don't know either.

21 Q Do you employ any physicians or anybody who has an  
22 M.D. degree as well as other degrees?

23 A Yes, we have the Medical Department.

24 Q Who is in charge of that?

25 A I think it's Bob Fletcher.

Sandra Harper & Associates

50833 4271  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 Q Do you ever work with them on anything?

2 A No.

3 Q Is it your understanding that they are to treat  
4 injured or for health purposes of your employees?

5 A Yes, that's basically why they are there.

6 Q They don't do any research into the relationship  
7 between tobacco and human beings?

8 A No, not to my knowledge.

9 Q Do you have the capacity or does your staff have the  
10 capacity to do those type of things?

11 A Well, I don't know exactly what it takes to do that,  
12 but I don't think so; I don't know what types of expertise.

13 Q I take it you're probably aware of the fact that the  
14 Surgeon General of the United States has published reports  
15 that say that smoking tobacco causes--is a cause of cancer;  
16 are you aware of that?

17 A Yes, I'm aware of that.

18 Q Do you agree with that?

19 A No, I don't agree with that.

20 Q Are you aware of the fact that the Surgeon General  
21 of the United States has also said that smoking cigarettes may  
22 be addictive; are you aware of that?

23 A Yes, I'm aware of that.

24 Q Do you agree with that?

25 A No, I don't agree with that.

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 Q Have you ever tried to quit smoking?

2 A Yes, I have quit smoking.

3 Q Without much problem at all?

4 A A little discomfort for a couple of days.

5 Q What's the longest period of time you've quit  
6 smoking for?

7 A I think about six months; it was somewhere in that  
8 neighborhood but it's been a number of years ago.

9 Q Why did you do that, Dr. Lloyd?

10 A Why did I quit smoking?

11 Q Yes.

12 A My doctor told me that I should.

13 Q Did he tell you to start back up?

14 A No, he didn't.

15 Q Did you get a new doctor? That's what I did when he  
16 told me to stop drinking. Was that with respect to any  
17 particular condition that you have or did he just suggest to  
18 you it might be in your best interest to quit smoking?

19 A I had asthma as a child, and he suggested to me that  
20 I probably should not smoke. Of course, I think he suggested  
21 that to everyone else as well.

22 Q That's pretty much the primary physician's point of  
23 view, is that your understanding, that smoking basically is--  
24 you're better off if you don't smoke?

25 A I certainly think many physicians take that

1 viewpoint.

2 Q Do you know any that don't?

3 A I don't know whether there are some that don't or  
4 not.

5 Q What about your present--do you have an internist?

6 A Yes.

7 Q What does he think about your smoking?

8 A We haven't discussed it in a long time; he knows  
9 that I smoke.

10 Q Has he ever suggested to you that you quit?

11 A He probably has.

12 Q Do you have any other physicians that have treated  
13 you within the last ten years that have suggested to you that  
14 you probably should quit smoking?

15 A I don't remember that to be the case, no, other than  
16 my primary physician.

17 Q I'm talking about primary; I'm talking about any  
18 now. How many physicians, Dr. Lloyd, in your life who have  
19 treated you for anything have suggested to you that you should  
20 quit smoking?

21 A I don't know; I can't remember that.

22 Q How many do you think have suggested to me that I  
23 quit drinking, Dr. Lloyd?

24 A I don't know that either.

25 Q My doctor drinks, and he's fatter than I am too;

50833 4274

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 that's why I picked him. You just go look at them, and you  
2 can tell which one you will like. Well, Dr. Lloyd, was it  
3 more than two doctors who have told you to quit smoking?

4 A I really don't know how many it was.

5 Q Well, we know it was two, right?

6 A I don't remember it being two.

7 Q Oh, was it the same doctor we were talking about,  
8 the one that told you that you should quit smoking, and you  
9 quit for six months?

10 A Probably not, you're probably right; it's two or  
11 more.

12 Q Who is your primary physician right now?

13 A He's a doctor at Winston-Salem Health Care.

14 Q Has Dr. Fletcher ever suggested to you that you quit  
15 smoking?

16 A No, I don't believe he has.

17 Q Does Dr. Fletcher smoke?

18 A I don't know.

19 Q Have you ever done any studies or any research with  
20 respect to what the likelihood of a person who smokes a pack a  
21 day for thirty years, thirty pack years, what the likelihood  
22 is they're going to contract lung cancer?

23 A No.

24 Q Are you interested in those type of things or is  
25 that--

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4275

1           A    That's not part of what I do; that's not part of my  
2 primary responsibility.

3           Q    Have you read the Surgeon General's Reports over the  
4 years?

5           A    I'm sure I've read parts of them.

6           Q    Do you question the statistical information and  
7 basis that they have for reaching their conclusions, and I'm  
8 not talking about reaching the conclusion they reached; I'm  
9 talking about the information that they have?

10          A    I'm not sure I understand your question exactly.

11          Q    Well, I'll show you some stuff just for the heck of  
12 it. I'd like you to look at page 11 of DiMarco Deposition  
13 Exhibit No. 2 which is entitled, "Smoking Tobacco and Health"  
14 and ask you if you will look at that page for a minute.

15          A    (Witness reviewing document)

16          Q    There's both a two paragraph sentence on page 11 and  
17 then there are some bar graphs to the side there and while you  
18 may not agree with the conclusions that are contained in this  
19 paragraph, do you have any argument with or any reason to  
20 argue with the statistical data if that's an appropriate term,  
21 statistical data, that is represented by the bar graph?

22          A    I don't have any reason to agree with it or disagree  
23 with it. I don't know what the studies are. This is a  
24 document that I've never seen before, and I don't know what  
25 the basis for arriving at these numbers is; I haven't seen

1 the data.

2 Q You are aware that there is data that exists that  
3 shows that the incidence of lung cancer is higher in people  
4 who smoke than people who do not smoke; you're aware of that,  
5 aren't you?

6 A I'm aware that there are epidemiological studies  
7 that show a high correlation between smoking and cancer, yes.

8 Q Do you have any argument professionally with those  
9 epidemiological studies--not necessarily the conclusion people  
10 draw from them but the fact that there is this number of  
11 people who smoke that have cancer and this number of people  
12 who don't smoke that have cancer?

13 A I'm a chemist; I can't judge those studies.

14 Q Well, you're a scientist and so when I ask you if  
15 you have any argument with them--you don't know anything  
16 specifically yourself that would indicate that those studies  
17 are wrong? Of course, the converse of that is probably true  
18 also.

19 MR. McDERMOTT: I object to the form of that  
20 question. I don't think there is any foundation. I  
21 believe he has testified that he hasn't read the studies  
22 so his technical training or background really doesn't  
23 help him one way or the other. If he hasn't read the  
24 studies, he couldn't evaluate them. If you think you  
25 can answer the question, go ahead.

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4277

1                   MR. COOK: We may have to swear you in if you're  
2                   going to help him answer.

3                   MR. McDERMOTT: Nobody will vouch for my  
4                   credibility.

5                   THE WITNESS: I really haven't read the studies, and  
6                   I haven't seen this document before; and I can't quarrel  
7                   with it, and I can't say it's right.

8                   MR. COOK: Good, that's what I said; thank you.

9                   Q        (By Mr. Cook) You've worked at this company for  
10                   over twenty years, for twenty-three years I guess to be more  
11                   precise, and precision is the soul of wit; isn't it?

12                  A        We're very precise people, scientists; we try to be.

13                  MR. COOK: Most lawyers were never toilet trained;  
14                   most scientists were trained at a very early age.

15                  MR. CRIST: Let the record reflect he's not speaking  
16                   on behalf of the entire group here.

17                  MR. COOK: However, on the average--

18                  Q        (By Mr. Cook) I would assume that as the reports  
19                   come out from the Surgeon General that you as a scientist or  
20                   at least as a manager of employees at R. J. Reynolds, you're  
21                   at least interested in them; aren't you?

22                  A        We're interested in them, yes.

23                  Q        This time I asked "you"; I didn't say--I realize  
24                   your company is. I mean, you are a scientist; you are a man  
25                   of letters and numbers, and epidemiological studies are

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 something that you would have the capability of understanding  
2 I assume?

3 A I'm not sure that's totally the case. I'm a  
4 chemist, and I'm not trained in that area; I'm not a  
5 statistician.

6 Q Have you ever made any attempt to discover whether  
7 or not the information as far as the epidemiology is concerned  
8 is accurate or inaccurate?

9 A I don't know that I've ever gone and done that, no.

10 Q Have you ever discussed with anybody within your  
11 company whether or not the statistical data is accurate?

12 A I don't know that I've discussed whether the  
13 statistical data is accurate or not; if I did I don't remember  
14 it.

15 Q The point that I'm making, Doctor, and which I'm  
16 sure is sufficiently obtuse is, I understand you don't agree  
17 with the conclusion, and I understand that there are a number  
18 of people who don't agree with the conclusions that are drawn  
19 from the epidemiological studies. But numbers are numbers,  
20 and they're either accurate or they're not accurate and what  
21 I'm interested in is whether or not anyone has ever inferred  
22 to you that the numbers used, the statistics used, are  
23 erroneous as opposed to the conclusion drawn being not  
24 warranted?

25 A If I can answer your question, I really don't know

Sandra Harper & Associates

50833 4279  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1       whether the statistics used are good or bad. We have people  
2       who look at that area; I don't specifically myself. What I  
3       have understood in general is that even if the epidemiological  
4       studies are correct, it shows--it's insufficient to say that  
5       this shows cause of--that cancer is caused by cigarette  
6       smoking.

7       Q       But what I'm interested in right now--I understand  
8       the latter part of your answer. Who is the person or who are  
9       the people who look into these numbers?

10      A       Sam Simmons would certainly be one who looks at it;  
11      he's probably the principal one.

12      Q       Anybody else?

13      A       He's certainly the expert.

14      Q       Is he an epidemiologist to your knowledge?

15      A       I'm not sure what his background is specifically.

16      Q       Has he ever suggested to you that the numbers that  
17       are used as the basis for the conclusion reached of cause and  
18       effect, that the numbers, that the data is incorrect?

19      A       I don't know that he has; I don't remember  
20       discussing it.

21      Q       Have you ever been at seminars or discussions within  
22       your plant discussing the Surgeon General's Reports?

23      A       I may have been; I don't specifically recall them.

24      Q       Has anyone ever suggested to you in any documents  
25       that you receive that you either protest or lobby politicians

*Sandra Harper & Associates*

50833 4280  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 concerning regulations of the cigarette industry?

2 A Would you repeat the question please?

3 Q Sure. Has anyone ever encouraged you to lobby or  
4 write or protest to politicians concerning regulation or  
5 proposed regulations of the cigarette industry?

6 A I don't remember anyone having done so.

7 Q Do you remember when television advertising of  
8 cigarettes was abolished?

9 A Not the specific year.

10 Q Did you think that was unfair, Doctor, when they did  
11 that?

12 A I wasn't in a position to judge whether it was fair  
13 or unfair.

14 Q What do you think? You don't have any opinion?

15 A I don't have a position on that.

16 Q Do you think cigarette companies should be allowed  
17 to advertise cigarettes?

18 A Yes, it's a legal product; we sell it in a legal  
19 manner.

20 Q Do you think that they should be able to advertise  
21 and sell them to children?

22 A No.

23 Q Why not?

24 A It's not our position to do so.

25 Q Why not?

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4281

1           A    We think it's an adult decision.

2           Q    When did your company arrive at that decision; do  
3 you know?

4           A    In the years that I've been here, it's never been  
5 our position to try to sell cigarettes to children.

6           Q    The first advertisement that I'm able to find, and I  
7 may be wrong about it, where RJR encouraged children not to  
8 smoke was in 1984; do you remember advertisements or  
9 suggestions by RJR prior to 1984 where they suggested that  
10 children should not smoke?

11          A    I don't personally remember them, no.

12          Q    How old were you when you started smoking, Doctor?

13          A    I probably had my first cigarette when I was around  
14 fifteen.

15          Q    Where did you go to high school?

16          A    High Point High School.

17          Q    High Point, North Carolina?

18          A    High Point, North Carolina.

19          Q    Do you know David Ipock?

20          A    Ipock, I don't think I know the name.

21          Q    I was in the Navy with a guy named Ipock from  
22 High Point, and you and I are of an age--a little blond kid.

23          A    It's possible.

24          Q    He and I were in boot camp together. I bet he got  
25 thrown out of your high school just at the same time I got

50833 4282

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 thrown out of mine--David Irock--I-P-O-C-K. It would have  
2 been interesting if you had known him. Did you graduate from  
3 high school?

4 A Yes.

5 Q I missed that honor. Was it a lot of fun?

6 A (No response)

7 Q Did they have a smoking area set aside for students  
8 in your high school at that period of time?

9 A I don't believe they did, no.

10 Q Did you have what they call an open campus or closed  
11 campus in your high school or do you know?

12 A I don't know what you mean by that.

13 Q Could you leave the school during the day?

14 A Yes, we could.

15 Q So if you would smoke during the day, you wouldn't  
16 smoke in the school; you'd smoke outside?

17 A We couldn't smoke in the school building.

18 Q Do you have children?

19 A Yes, I do.

20 Q Have you discouraged them from smoking?

21 A Really the subject has never been discussed very  
22 much.

23 Q How old is your oldest child?

24 A Twenty.

25 Q Does he or she smoke?

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4283

1 A No.

2 Q Is it a he or a she?

3 A It's a he.

4 Q Is he in school somewhere?

5 A He's in college.

6 Q Where?

7 A Appalachian State.

8 Q The Mountaineers--

9 MR. CRIST: One and a half out of four if we're  
10 keeping track.

11 MR. COOK: I wish you guys would get back in the  
12 Big Ten; I was doing well with the Badgers and  
13 Ms. Beasley. I was really on a roll there. Wasn't  
14 Iauco from Ohio State; where was he from?

15 MR. BLIXT: I think he was from Ohio State.

16 Q (By Mr. Cook) How old is your next oldest child?

17 A I don't have another one.

18 Q Well, one boy twenty years old should be enough I  
19 would think; I've got one twenty-one and twenty-two. You've  
20 never read the Surgeon General's Reports in-depth, any of  
21 them; do I understand you correctly that that's your  
22 testimony?

23 A I haven't read them in-depth; I've looked at parts  
24 of them, but I haven't studied the reports.

25 Q In the parts that you've looked at, is there

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4284

1 something significant that you recall that you either agree  
2 with or you said, "This can't be right" type of thing?

3 A I can't specifically recall that.

4 Q Looking at the bar graph in front of you on the  
5 "Relative Risk of Lung Cancer Deaths, by Sex," it looks to me  
6 looking at that that the risk is about twenty-two times more  
7 according to this if you smoke, and you're a male than if you  
8 don't smoke; is that the way that you would analyze that?

9 A Well, I really haven't seen this document before  
10 until today. I don't know where these numbers come from.

11 Q Oh, I mean, just looking at this, does that seem to  
12 be what they represent? I'm not asking you to assume that  
13 they're accurate.

14 MR. McDERMOTT: You're asking for his  
15 interpretation of this data?

16 MR. COOK: Yes.

17 THE WITNESS: That's what the numbers seem to say;  
18 I don't know the context.

19 Q (By Mr. Cook) Would you look at page 15 of that  
20 document, Plaintiff's Exhibit No.--whatever it is--

21 MR. McDERMOTT: Two.

22 Q (By Mr. Cook) That portion of the document has,  
23 "A Smoker's Level of Nicotine Over 24 Hours." Is this the  
24 type of thing that you may have done some work on?

25 A I haven't done any work in this area.

50833 4285

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 Q You've not done any; have you done work that relates  
2 to the amount of nicotine that is ingested by smokers?

3 MR. McDERMOTT: Are you asking for his personal  
4 experience?

5 MR. COOK: Yes, either him or people under his  
6 supervision.

7 THE WITNESS: I haven't personally done this kind of  
8 work, no.

9 Q (By Mr. Cook) Have people in your group done it?

10 A Not people in my group, no.

11 Q How about people in the R&D Center at RJR?

12 A I think there's been work done in this area, yes,  
13 specific work.

14 Q Who would do that type of thing, Dr. Lloyd?

15 A I think John Robinson would be the expert in this  
16 area.

17 Q He's a psychologist; isn't he?

18 A I'm not sure exactly what his discipline is.

19 Q Quicker than you can say "Jack Robinson"?

20 A Pretty close.

21 Q You think that he's done some work in nicotine  
22 levels in human beings?

23 A (Witness nodding head yes)

24 MR. McDERMOTT: Make your response audible.

25 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry; yes, he has done some of

50833 4286

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1                   this work.

2                   Q     (By Mr. Cook) Anybody else you can think of who may  
3 have done some work on that?

4                   A     I think he's the expert.

5                   Q     Anybody else that you can think of who has worked  
6 with him or worked on that type of thing?

7                   A     He has some technicians and there are some other  
8 staff people in the area.

9                   Q     But he would be the only scientist that you know of?

10                  A     I really don't know everybody who has worked in this  
11 area or what work they have done; he's the one that always  
12 comes to mind.

13                  Q     Do you think that people before they make a decision  
14 to smoke should be aware of the fact that cigarette smoking  
15 may be addictive?

16                  A     I think that people before they make the decision to  
17 smoke already feel that smoking is addictive.

18                  Q     That, of course, isn't what I asked you, what they  
19 feel; I asked you whether they should be aware of that.

20                  A     I can't make judgments on shoulds or oughts; I know  
21 there's plenty of information out there that says that smoking  
22 is addictive and it has been for a long time.

23                  Q     R. J. Reynolds hasn't put any information out with  
24 respect to its cigarettes, warning people that its use might  
25 be addictive; have they?

*Sandra Harper & Associates*

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4287

1       A    Not to my knowledge.

2       Q    Has R. J. Reynolds ever warned anybody that  
3 cigarette smoking, that they think it may cause cancer?

4       A    I think there are warnings on the pack.

5       Q    It doesn't say anything about R. J. Reynolds; does  
6 it?

7       A    I really don't know who should be obligated to do  
8 what.

9       Q    I didn't ask you who should be obligated; I asked  
10 you if they've ever done it to your knowledge. Has  
11 R. J. Reynolds ever said, "We, the manufacturer of Winston  
12 cigarettes, think that cigarette smoking may be hazardous to  
13 your health"?

14      A    I don't know.

15      Q    Have you ever read anything like that?

16      A    I'm not sure that I have if I understood your  
17 question correctly.

18      Q    Do you get the management bulletins and the  
19 "Caravans" and things like that?

20      A    Yes.

21      Q    Doesn't R. J. Reynolds publish materials for the  
22 tobacco industry that take issue--in the "Caravan" and things  
23 like that--that take issue with the causative relationship  
24 between smoking and cancer?

25      A    I'm sorry; would you repeat the question?

Sandra Harper & Associates

50833 4288  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1           Q     Sure. R. J. Reynolds takes issue with the conclusion  
2     drawn by the Surgeon General that there's a relationship  
3     between smoking and deleterious health; isn't that true?

4           A     Yes, we do.

5           Q     And so you've never published anything that says,  
6     "Hey, we believe, R. J. Reynolds"--you've never seen that  
7     anywhere--"We believe that if you smoke cigarettes, you may  
8     get cancer"; you don't say that, do you?

9           A     No, we don't believe that.

10          Q     That's why I was asking.

11          A     We believe that it's not proven; it's neither proven  
12     nor unproven and that is our specific, stated policy.

13          Q     And you don't believe that people are addicted to  
14     them because if you believed it, you would tell people:  
15     wouldn't you?

16          A     Well, let me answer the question this way. If  
17     people were truly addicted, we wouldn't have lost millions of  
18     customers over the last few years to people who have quit.

19          Q     Or you would have lost all of them, Dr. Long, not  
20     just most of them. Dr. Long, do you believe--do you drink,  
21     sir?

22          MR. McDERMOTT: It's Dr. Lloyd.

23          MR. COOK: Dr. Lloyd, I'm sorry; I need a Camel.

24          MR. BLIXT: Do you want to take a break?

25          MR. COOK: No, I'd smoke right here if I was

1 drinking; we'd just fire them up. I'll bring some of my  
2 partners; they're damn good. I told this joke before,  
3 but I'll tell it again. No, I won't.

4 Q (By Mr. Cook) Do you think that some people are  
5 addicted to the use of alcohol?

6 A I don't know whether they are or not.

7 Q What does addiction mean to you?

8 A I'm not really well versed in what addiction means.

9 Q What does it mean to you? Is it a word without  
10 meaning to you?

11 A No, it's not a word without meaning.

12 Q Tell me what it means to you please?

13 A Well, I'm really not an expert in that area; I can't  
14 tell you the specific definition of addiction.

15 Q I just want to know what it means to you. It may  
16 mean oranges to you and if it means oranges to you, please  
17 tell me--"Addiction means oranges to me, Mr. Cook."

18 A Well, to me it means that people would be unable to  
19 quit.

20 Q That seems to be a very reasonable meaning to me  
21 also. Do you know of or do you acknowledge that there are  
22 people who use alcohol who are unable to quit its use?

23 A There may be: it's not a subject that I've studied.

24 Q Do you know what Antabuse is?

A I believe it's used in alcohol treatment programs.

1       Q     It makes people violently ill like they've taken  
2     Ipecac if they've used alcohol.  Are you familiar with that?

3       A     Only what you've just said.

4       Q     Do you think that there are people who are unable to  
5     quit drinking?

6       A     I don't know.

7       Q     You don't know that?  Do you ever go to the movies?  
8     Did you ever see "The Days of Wine and Roses" and things like  
9     that, any of those type of things?

10      A     Sure.

11      Q     That was a movie about alcoholics; wasn't it?

12      A     That was a movie.

13      Q     Would you agree with a common definition that you  
14     and I might have about addiction of the fact that you and I  
15     think that there are some people that are from time to time  
16     addicted to alcohol?

17      A     I really don't know about that; I don't know whether  
18     you could say "addicted" or not.  I believe people can be  
19     addicted to heroin, but I don't think that alcohol and  
20     cigarette smoking are the same thing as heroin.

21      Q     I don't think they are either, and I think people  
22     can quit the use of heroin; don't you?  They do.

23      A     I don't know about that.

24      Q     You don't know whether or not people quit the use of  
25     heroin?  This document in front of you has got--shows on

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 page 8, "Relapse Rate Over Time for Heroin, Smoking and  
2 Alcohol." Are you looking at page 8?

3 A No.

4 Q Go ahead and look at that.

5 A (Witness reviewing document)

6 Q What do you think that graph shows?

7 A Gee, I don't know; I just looked at it, and I  
8 haven't seen this document before.

9 Q You've told me that before, Doctor.

10 MR. McDERMOTT: Is there a question pending, Bruce?

11 MR. COOK: I'm asking him to look at that, and I  
12 assume when he's finished that he will look up. He's  
13 not going to look up.

14 MR. McDERMOTT: You've just given him the key.

15 Q (By Mr. Cook) What do you think about that graph;  
16 can you make hide nor hair of it? It looks to me like the  
17 relapse rate for alcoholics is worse than for heroin or people  
18 who try to quit smoking; that's what it would probably  
19 indicate, wouldn't it?

20 A I really don't know; I've just seen this for the  
21 first time. I'd like to study it before I comment on it; I  
22 don't feel like I can comment on something that's put in front  
23 of me like this today.

24 Q Well, you may get another opportunity. Are you  
25 aware of any studies that have been done that relate to the

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 effect of quitting smoking on a person's life expectancy or  
2 their freedom from disease?

3 A There may be such studies; I don't know about them.  
4 I haven't studied in that area; that's not my area of  
5 expertise.

6 Q You, of course, smoke?

7 A I do smoke.

8 Q And I assume that you want to--or as Martin Luther  
9 King said, "Longevity is the thing to be desired." I assume  
10 that you would like to live as long as you comfortably can?

11 A Certainly.

12 Q If you were aware of the fact that your life  
13 expectancy would be radically increased if you quit smoking,  
14 do you think that you would consider quitting?

15 A I think you're asking me to speculate. Obviously,  
16 I'd like to live as long as possible.

17 Q But you're not aware of any knowledge or any  
18 information that exists as to what effect on your life  
19 expectancy quitting smoking might have; are you?

20 A I'm not aware of--personally aware of the data. I'm  
21 personally aware there's a warning on the pack that says that  
22 so there must be a study somewhere.

23 Q Do you think that if you quit smoking today that it  
24 would increase your life expectancy?

25 A I really don't know. I can say that I know the

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4293

1 risks of smoking, and I've chosen to smoke because I enjoy it.

2 Q What are the risks that you think that you subject  
3 yourself to by continuing to smoke?

4 A What are the risks?

5 Q Yes, you say you know what they are; tell me?

6 A There are risks of contracting a number of diseases  
7 if you believe the epidemiological results.

8 Q Do you believe them?

9 A I have no basis to believe them or not believe them  
10 but what I do know is that there is no causative proof which  
11 is a second part which is not done by epidemiological studies  
12 as to whether there is cause or not; they are insufficient.

13 Q You really don't believe, do you, that if you  
14 continue to smoke that you're going to contract cancer because  
15 you're continuing to smoke?

16 A I don't know if I am or if I'm not.

17 Q Well, my question wasn't whether you knew; I said,  
18 "You don't believe that you are going to contract cancer if  
19 you continue to smoke; do you?"

20 A I believe I am at some risk just like I believe I'm  
21 at some risk from eating charcoal broiled steaks or a number  
22 of other things or following a bus down the highway.

23 Q Do you think that your risk from charcoal broiled  
24 steaks is as high as your risk is from smoking?

25 A I have no way to know whether it is or is not.

1       Q     Have you ever made any attempt to find out whether  
2 there are epidemiological studies on the number of people  
3 assassinated by steaks?

4       A     I have not really looked for those studies.

5       Q     Do you like steaks?

6       A     Sure.

7       Q     I do too especially if they're charcoal broiled;  
8 that's the way I like them the best.

9            MR. BLIXT: They're better in Illinois than they are  
10           in North Carolina.

11           MR. COOK: Are they really? We've got better cows;  
12           don't we?

13        Q     (By Mr. Cook) Would you agree that you think that  
14           most eighteen year olds in our society now have sufficient  
15           information to make a knowledgeable choice as to whether or  
16           not they should smoke or not in terms of risks to their  
17           health?

18        A     I think that you can't pick up a newspaper or turn  
19           on the television set without seeing a great deal about the  
20           risks of smoking, and I think that has been the case for many,  
21           many years. I knew it when I started, that there were risks  
22           associated.

23        Q     Would you agree that your I.Q. is probably above  
24           average?

25        A     I don't know.

50833 4295

*Sandra Harper & Associates*

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 Q You don't?

2 A No, I don't; some days I think it's a hell of a long  
3 way below average.

4 Q Do you really; you don't really think that ever, do  
5 you? Do you really?

6 A Some days I think it is.

7 Q Do you?

8 A Uh-huh.

9 Q Did you ever teach?

10 A I've taught some.

11 Q I assume you were on a fellowship or teaching  
12 assistantship while working on your Ph.D.?

13 A Yes, I was in a teaching assistantship.

14 MR. McDERMOTT: Bruce, can we take a break for a  
15 couple of minutes?

16 MR. COOK: Sure, off the record.

17 (Break taken from 3:25 p.m. until 3:30 p.m.)

18 MR. COOK: Back on the record.

19 Q (By Mr. Cook) Dr. Lloyd, I'd like to talk to you  
20 about one more thing and then I'm going--do you have someone  
21 else waiting for us?

22 MR. BLIXT: I think there is.

23 MR. COOK: Who do we have?

24 MR. CRIST: Dan Pearson.

25 MR. COOK: Okay, I'll hurry up with Dr. Lloyd.

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4296

1 Q (By Mr. Cook) Would you look at page 5 of that  
2 document that you have there in front of you, Dr. Lloyd?

3 A (Witness reviewing document)

4 Q I'd really like for you to look at the 1987 line.

5 A (Witness reviewing document)

6 Q Were you aware that studies done on who smokes, that  
7 people with lower educational levels generally smoke at a  
8 higher percentage than people with more education?

9 A It's not something that I've thought a great deal  
10 about.

11 Q You weren't aware of that?

12 A (No response)

13 Q You were aware of it, but you didn't think a great  
14 deal about it--which one?

15 A I'm probably aware of it but haven't thought a great  
16 deal about it.

17 Q As you look at these figures, it looks like the  
18 smoking rate of people who have less than a high school, less  
19 than twelve years of education is more than twice the rate of  
20 those who graduated from college; you agree with that I assume  
21 as you're looking at page 5?

22 A That's what the data on this page seems to indicate.

23 Q And you don't have any reason to believe this data  
24 is incorrect; do you?

25 A I don't have a reason to believe it is correct or

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4297

1      incorrect; I don't know the source of this data, and I don't  
2      know what the data is. This is a table of percentages, but I  
3      don't know how it was developed.

4      Q      Now let's just assume for a second that this data is  
5      correct. What reasons can you come to why people who are more  
6      highly educated smoke less than people who are not?

7      A      I really haven't given that a great deal of thought.

8      Q      Can you think of any just offhand?

9      A      I think that the population in general whether it's  
10     high school educated or less than that or college graduated  
11     all know the risks of smoking; why people choose to smoke, I  
12     don't know. Maybe it's something--stress--I don't know.

13     Q      Do you think that people who graduated from college  
14     read more newspapers than people who haven't graduated from  
15     high school?

16     A      I don't have any reason to know that.

17     Q      Do you think that they read more magazines like  
18     "Time" and "U.S. News and World Report" than people who  
19     haven't graduated from high school?

20     A      You could be right about that. I don't know; I  
21     don't have any knowledge in that particular area.

22     Q      Well, haven't you ever--don't you know any people  
23     who haven't graduated from high school other than me?

24     A      I was going to say "you."

25     Q      Am I the only one?

50833 4298

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1           A    I'm sure not.

2           Q    Do you hire people at your plant to work there as  
3 hourly people if they've not graduated from high school?

4           A    I'm not sure about the hiring practices now; we  
5 certainly have people there who did not graduate from high  
6 school.

7           Q    Do you suspect that probably you have a minimum  
8 entry requirement of a high school education into your hourly  
9 work force?

10          A    I'm just not sure right now what those requirements  
11 are.

12          Q    Do you know generally? You read newspapers, don't  
13 you, and magazines I assume?

14          A    Yes.

15          Q    Do you know that generally in the industry in the  
16 United States that most manufacturers require an entry level  
17 of a high school diploma or its equivalent before they'll hire  
18 people or don't you know that either?

19          A    I just don't know; I don't know what employment  
20 practices are.

21          Q    Are your hourly workers unionized down here?

22          A    No, they're not.

23          Q    I was looking through, and I see you've been  
24 fighting them over the years; and I wondered who won. Would  
25 you look at page 4 of that document?

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1       A     (Witness reviewing document)

2       Q     I'm particularly interested in the portion where it  
3 compares white and black males. Do you have any judgment why  
4 black males would smoke more on a percentage basis than white  
5 males?

6       A     I'm trying to figure out the relevance of these  
7 numbers. I haven't really--

8       Q     Well, in 1987 white male smokers twenty years and  
9 over smoked--according to this data 30.7 percent of them were  
10 smokers. Black males, 40.3 percent were smokers. It's right  
11 in the middle of the page. Do you see under 1987?

12      A     Okay, up here, yes, I see it.

13      Q     What significance do you draw from that, Dr. Lloyd?

14      A     Well, the only significance I can draw from it is if  
15 this data is correct, there are more blacks over twenty years  
16 old who smoke than there are whites.

17      Q     Would you agree that there are probably--if you and  
18 I were to check out the educational backgrounds of blacks and  
19 whites, we would probably find that less black people or a  
20 greater number of black people do not have high school  
21 diplomas in this country than white people or don't you know  
22 that?

23            MR. McDERMOTT: Are we still talking about black  
24            males? There is data on black females too.

25            MR. COOK: I'm talking about black males right now.

Sandra Harper & Associates

50833 4300  
501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1                   MR. McDERMOTT: There is data on black females as  
2                   well that seems to show the shift the other way.

3                   MR. COOK: That is true. I think that that is  
4                   particularly interesting too despite everything--despite  
5                   Clarence Thomas pawing them.

6                   MR. McDERMOTT: Allegedly.

7                   MR. COOK: I believed her.

8                   Q        (By Mr. Cook) As a former educator do you have an  
9                   understanding that there is an education crisis that exists in  
10                   our black urban areas in the United States in terms of black  
11                   people dropping out of high school; did you know that that is  
12                   a problem?

13                   A        I've certainly heard that it is, but I don't know  
14                   it.

15                   Q        You've probably seen those programs on "60 Minutes"  
16                   and "20/20" where they're trying to do all kinds of things to  
17                   encourage young black males to stay in high school; you're  
18                   aware generally of that?

19                   A        Yes.

20                   Q        That would seem to correlate then--if you would look  
21                   on page 4 and look at the white males, black males and then  
22                   you look at the educational experience and the number of  
23                   smokers, that would seem to make some sense?

24                   A        I really can't judge that.

25                   Q        You just can't do that, okay. Would you look at

50833 4301

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1 page 6 with me just for a minute?

2 A (Witness reviewing document)

3 MR. McDERMOTT: Are you interested in the tables?

4 MR. COOK: I would like for you to look at household  
5 incomes, and I wonder if you think that rich people hire  
6 other people to smoke for them? Never mind. That's all.  
7 Dr. Lloyd. I have nothing further.

8

9

10 (END OF THE EXAMINATION AT 3:40 P.M.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

50833 4302

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

## CERTIFICATION

I, Sandra Harper, Notary Public in and for the County of  
Forsyth, State of North Carolina at Large, do hereby certify:

4 That there appeared before me the foregoing witness at  
5 the time and place herein aforementioned;

6 That the said witness was sworn by me to state the truth,  
7 the whole truth and nothing but the truth in said case;

8 That the testimony was taken before me by stenomask and  
9 thereafter reduced to typewriting under my supervision, and  
10 the foregoing forty-eight (48) pages contain a full, true and  
11 correct record of all the testimony given by said witness;

12       That the undersigned is not of kin, nor in any wise  
13 associated with any of the parties to said cause of action,  
14 nor their counsel, and that I am not interested in the event  
15 thereof.

16 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and seal  
17 this 29th day of November, 1991.

18

19

20

21

2

1

## Notary Public and Court Reporter

Sandra Harper & Associates

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

50833 4303

**WITNESS CERTIFICATION**

2 I, ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D., do hereby certify:

3       That I have read and examined the contents of the  
4 foregoing pages of testimony as given by me at the time and  
5 place herein aforementioned;

6 And that to the best of my knowledge and belief, the  
7 foregoing pages of testimony are a complete and accurate  
8 record of all the testimony given by me, except for the  
9 changes and/or corrections (if any) on the attached errata  
10 sheet.

## 11 || Changes and/or corrections

12 have ✓, have not \_\_\_\_\_.

13 been made on the attached  
14 errata sheet.

Debra A. Lloyd, Jr.

(ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D.)

17 I, Christa N. Mathis, Notary Public for the County  
18 of Forsyth, State of North Carolina do  
19 hereby certify:

20 That Robert A. Lloyd, Jr. personally appeared  
21 before me this the 27 day of December, 19 91;

22        And I personally witnessed the execution of this document  
23 for the intents and purposes herein above described.

24 My Commission Expires: 8/14/96 Christa W. Mathis



OFFICIAL SEAL  
CHRISTA N. MATHIS  
NOTARY PUBLIC-NORTH CAROLINA  
COUNTY OF FORSYTH

## Notary Public

*Sandra Harper & Associates*

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103  
Phone: (919) 768-3694

1                   WITNESS ERRATA SHEET

2                   Upon review of the transcription of my testimony,  
3                   the following changes and/or corrections should be made  
4                   to my deposition:

5 PAGE	6 * LINE	7 * REASON FOR CHANGE
6	*	*
7	*	*
8	*	*
9	*	*
10	*	*
11	*	*
12	*	*
13	*	*
14	*	*
15	*	*
16	*	*
17	*	*
18	*	*
19	*	*
20	*	*
21	*	*
22	*	*
23		
24		
25		

(ROBERT A. LLOYD, JR., Ph.D.)

50833 4305

*Sandra Hayter & Associates*

501 Shepherd Street  
Winston-Salem, N.C. 27103

Phone: (919) 768-3694

## ERRATA SHEET

Deposition of Robert A. Lloyd, Jr., Ph.D.  
Taken on November 21, 1991  
In the Circuit Court, Twentieth Judicial Circuit  
St. Clair County, Illinois  
Kueper v. R.J.R., Inc., R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Co., et al.  
No. 91-L-734

<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>Now Reads</u>	<u>Should Read</u>	<u>Reason for Change</u>
5	20	nuclear magnetic resonance,	nuclear magnetic resonance	4
6	21	industrial starch,	industrial starch	4
7	1	starched	starch	3
7	22-23	Tobacco and tobacco smoke would be an extremely complex mixture	Tobacco and tobacco smoke are extremely complex mixtures	3
9	21	Premiere	Premier	5
10	17	spectrography	spectroscopy	1
14	8	Premiere	Premier	5
15	5	Premiere	Premier	5
15	20	Premiere	Premier	5
16	10	Premiere	Premier	5

- \* 1 - inaccurate transcription
- 2 - more accurate
- 3 - grammatical error
- 4 - punctuation error
- 5 - typographic error

Signature of Witness: Robert A. Lloyd, Jr. · Date Signed: 12/27/91